

EDINBURGH AIRPORT NOISE ADVISORY BOARD

Minutes of Twenty Second Meeting held on Wednesday 5th June 2019

At the Marriott Hotel, 111 Glasgow Road, Edinburgh

Commencing at 6.30pm

Present: Lindsey Cole (LC) (Chair)

Merv Archibald (MA), Blackness Area CC; Bruce Finlayson (BF); Vic Garrard (VG), Kirknewton CC; Sharon Gibson (SG) Pumpherston CC; Ray Godfree (RG), Ratho & District CC; North Queensferry CC; Louise Gunstensen, (LG), Dalgety Bay CC; Tom Leatherland (TL), Limekilns and Charleston CC; Christophe Miremont (CM), Ecclesmachan resident; Helena Paul (HP), Blackness Area CC / Edinburgh Airport Watch; Pippa Plevin (PP), Uphall CC; Liz Scobie (LS), Uphall CC; Andrew Watt (AW), Dalkeith & District CC & Midlothian Federation CC

In Attendance: Louise McIntyre (LMcI) EAL; Lynne Hainsworth & Elaine Hill (Minutes)

Apologies: Adam Cumming (AC), Cramond Association; Ray Flint (RF), Kinghorn CC; Neil Lovett (NL), East Calder & District CC; Tom Wylie (TM) Cramond and Barnton CC

ITEM		ACTION
1.	Introductions: On behalf of the Chair, AC welcomed everyone to the meeting. The Chair introduced Sharon Gibson representing Pumpherston CC and welcomed her to her first meeting.	
2.	Approval of previous minutes: It was noted that meetings were held under Chatham House rules and therefore, with the exception of action points or specific requests at meetings, minuted comments were not attributable Approval of the minutes was proposed by MA and seconded by AW.	
3.	Matters Arising from previous meetings (3.1) 21.3.1 Consolidated Matters Outstanding from 1st May to 31 December 2018. Schedule appended to Minutes for May 2019 Noise complaints report (3.2) 17.8.1 Volunteers were requested to form the sub-group fronted by TL to analyse reports. It was noted that EAL had requested all suggested amendments to the reports be submitted together. Correspondence with JMcC is ongoing.	CLOSED
3.1	(3.3) 19.8.1 Aviation 2050 Consultation	EAL

3.2	<p><i>The Board agreed to support this in principle.</i></p> <p>Ongoing for discussion prior to deadline for submission at 20th June.</p>	ALL/HP/LG
3.3	<p>(3.4) 20.4.1 Aviation Consultancy Sub-Group</p> <p><i>Meeting now to be arranged with NATS. It was agreed that the sub-sub group would forward suggested items for discussion together with suggested dates and EAL would then contact NATS to arrange. Five members of the sub-group will be going across to Prestwick to meet NATS tomorrow (6th June), to discuss a list of questions which has been prepared. A note of the meeting will be prepared.</i></p>	AW
3.4	<p>(3.5) 20.4.2 Arrivals Sub Sub-Group</p> <p><i>Arrivals sub-sub group meeting to be held to agree timescales for actions</i></p> <p>This arose from all arrivals being covered another group to cover local arrivals. This has not been taken on so must be addressed later.</p>	Ongoing Arrivals SS-G
3.5	<p>(3.6) 20.4.7 Health</p> <p><i>It was agreed to speak to SS to see if he could suggest an individual or organisation that could help move this matter forward.</i></p> <p>SS had been approached but to date there had been no response.</p>	ONGOING AC
3.6	<p>(3.7) 20.4.9 <i>It was noted that sub-groups were still required for noise complaints and noise fines</i></p> <p>Ongoing</p>	ALL
3.7	<p>(3.8) <i>EAL confirmed that they had not yet received a date for an ACP assessment meeting with the CAA. Once this was known EAL would come back to the Board to discuss the relationship between EAL and the Board going forward.</i></p> <p>The assessment of Statement of Need Stage 1A is on 17th June 20. EAL will report back.</p>	EAL
	<p>(3.9) ACP Statement of Need</p> <p>20.5.1 <i>The Board had several queries regarding the document including the use of 0400-0700; air navigation guidance, etc. It was agreed that these comments/queries should be collated into one email and forwarded to EAL as soon as possible and preferably before the end of this week to enable a detailed response.</i></p>	CLOSED
	<p>(3.10) 20.5.2 <i>It was agreed that EAL would present to the Board on the ACP as soon as the timelines were known. The Board stressed that it was important that they were given the opportunity to input to and influence the ACP.</i></p> <p>Covered under item 3.7 above.</p>	CLOSED
	<p>(3.11) 20.5.3 <i>It was agreed that a short list of follow-up questions to the CAA (following the seminar on 26 March) should be drawn up including how the Board can input into the FASI South consultation with regard to the consideration of North/South corridors. It was</i></p>	

3.8	<p><i>agreed to also write to CAA re the follow up questions and also the Aviation 2050 consultation before the end of this week. It was further agreed that the Chair would also phone the CAA to follow this up. Chair has contacted CAA by phone. EANAB aims to be formally involved in the process. HP to draft a letter re. Aviation 2050 and LC will forward it.</i></p>	HP/LC
	<p>(3.12) 20.6.3 EANAB Annual Report <i>It was agreed that the Board should circulate the final Report to all community councils to highlight the Board's work.</i></p>	CLOSED
	<p>(3.13) Aviation Strategy Annex A Response 20.7.1 Final document to be circulated to the Board and EAL In progress</p>	CLOSED
3.9	<p>3.14 NAP 20.7.2 <i>EAL were asked to provide information on noise charging that could be passed on to communities. EAL explained that there was no standard for this across the industry. It is hoped that it will trigger a reduction in night flights and this is a goal of the proposal. However it is impossible to say yet whether it will have any impact but this will be reviewed.</i></p>	ONGOING EAL
3.10	<p>3.15 Broxburn CC Representation 20.7.3 <i>As no response had been received from the Broxburn CC representative regarding her membership of the Board, it was agreed to contact them once more to see if they wished to be represented on the Board.</i> <i>It was noted that an individual did not need to be a Community Councillor to sit on the Board but could be a resident representing the CC.</i></p>	PP
3.11	<p>3.16 Noise & Proposed Residential Developments 21.3.16 <i>It was agreed that to draw up a list of bullet points on the different routes the Board could take to become a consultee on planning applications where residential developments could be affected by aircraft noise.</i> In progress</p>	LG
3.12	<p>21.4.1 Aviation Consultancy Sub-Group <i>It was agreed to upload the full To70 report to the EANAB website now followed by the summary report when ready.</i> MA summary report will be in today. A summary is prepared for communities to be uploaded ENA website.</p> <p>21.4.2 <i>Notes of the Noise Monitoring meeting on 16 April had been circulated to the Board. It was noted that the Board had concerns about how the meeting went. The Chair stressed that a further meeting should be arranged as soon as possible and a list of issues</i></p>	MA/PP

	<p><i>to be discussed would be issued to EAL. It was noted that the informal notes taken by the sub-group would also be circulated to EAL.</i></p>	
3.13	<p>The further meeting is seen as required to clarify the monitoring strategy, its aims and intended outcomes.</p>	EAL/ ACS-G
	<p>21.4.3 <i>The Board requested that the data from noise monitors which demonstrates how the mobile unit is used, the level of background noise, etc., be presented by EAL</i></p>	
3.14	<p>The information will be ready by the next meeting by JMcC. It was noted that Communities need to know where the monitors are and what they monitor. If there are more monitors it will assist the communities and the airport. A spread will help. EAL indicated the hope to be able to do this. The Board to inform EAL what type of information they are looking for in relation to Noise Monitors prior to EAL being able to present to the Board. A meeting will be convened.</p>	EAL
3.15	<p>21.4.4 <i>EAL agreed to involve the Aviation Consultancy Sub-Group in discussions with ERDC relating to noise modelling. It was noted that no further progress had been made and that any response received from ERDC would be shared with the sub-group.</i></p>	ONGOING EAL
3.16	<p>MOU 21.4.5 <i>Concern was also raised regarding the section on conflict resolution as the Board is not a legal entity so therefore would individual members be open to litigation.</i></p>	ONGOING BF
3.17	<p>21.4.6 <i>Clarification was also requested regarding when Section 6 regarding indemnity might apply.</i></p>	ONGOING BF
	<p>21 5.1 <i>It was agreed that noise data reports should continue to be produced monthly and quarterly until September to give a full year of monthly reports. After September 2019, only quarterly reports to be produced.</i> Ongoing reports are monthly until September</p>	CLOSED
	<p>21.5.2 <i>Suggested alterations/additions to the noise data reports, e.g. list of all complaint areas, number of night flights, number of departures on GOSAM split, be forwarded to TL for collating prior to sending to EAL.</i></p>	CLOSED
	<p>21.6.1 <i>Board members are asked to forward details of how they report back to their community councils and how they engage with the local community over noise.</i></p>	CLOSED
	<p>21.6.2 <i>Members were asked to forward their comments for consideration and inclusion where possible before the next draft was circulated to the Board for members to vote on the report before its issue. Covered by Item 5 below</i></p>	CLOSED

<p>3.18</p>	<p>21.7.1 June Meeting <i>It was noted that JMcC would be on holiday at the time of the June meeting. Therefore any requests for information should be made by w/c 20 May where possible including amendments to the noise data reports.</i></p> <p>21.7.2 EANAB Contacts for EAL The Board confirmed that MA was the main contact for the ACP sub-group. It was also noted that a secretary@eanab.org.uk email address would be set up.</p> <p>21.7.3 NAP Response <i>It was agreed to put this on the agenda for the June meeting.</i> Covered under item 6 below.</p>	<p>CLOSED</p> <p>PP</p> <p>CLOSED</p>
<p>4.</p>	<p>Updates from Sub-Groups:</p> <p>Aviation Consultancy Sub-Group The sub-group gave a presentation which is attached for your ease of reference.</p> <p>It was noted from the presentation that there has been a 15% increase in air traffic number between 2012 and 2018 and that there has been a gradual switch in runways from GOSAM to TALLA. There has also been a 52% increase in passenger numbers with aircraft becoming heavier.</p> <p>Statistics and radar data for 2011 to 2018 had been received from EAL. The To70 report shows that the aircraft profiles, speed and altitude presumed in the ANCON modelling are not what the aircraft are actually flying at Edinburgh Airport. It was noted that aircraft not using SIDs are ignored by noise monitors. Therefore there is no accurate noise monitoring of the effects on communities.</p> <p>It was noted that there was a commitment from EAL to use the data from the To70 report going forward. It was also noted that the sub-group now had information to enable the profiling of all SIDs.</p> <p>EAL confirmed that to date no new noise maps had been made and that CAA had yet to respond to the To70 findings.</p> <p>Aircraft Movement: No sub group.</p> <p>MOU A successful meeting had been held with EAL and final changes have been agreed. Wording on the use and access to a credit card for minor expenses still to be finalised. This is with EAL's Legal Dept..</p> <p>Health</p>	

<p>4.1</p>	<p>Following the resignation of SS, the Chair will take on this role temporarily and covered this topic on behalf of SS at the last EACC meeting. The health issue rests on the impact of the noise not the noise itself.</p> <p>The Chair agreed to look at identifying someone who could take on this issue and report back to the next meeting. It was suggested that local GPs or the University of Edinburgh may be interested in becoming involved. It was noted that there were 2 people at the Inverkeithing Public meeting who spoke about health. It was agreed to approach them to see if they would be interested in helping with scoping a study.</p> <p>It was also suggested that Andy Whiteman be approached regarding a debate in the Scottish Parliament.</p> <p>It was noted that ICCAN would be looking at the impact of noise on health. There was currently a 2 year strategy out for consultation. HP agreed to circulate a link. It was suggested that the Board could work with ICCAN on this.</p> <p>It was noted that the health assessment carried out for the previous ACP contained errors.</p>	<p>HP/LG</p>
<p>4.2</p>	<p>Compensation Any comments/issues, please let HP know as she has a meeting tomorrow in London. It was noted that compensation should always be the last resort.</p>	<p>ALL</p>
<p>4.3</p>	<p>Review of Issues Log: This log should be used as a monitoring mechanism. The subgroups and champions must begin to supply updates monthly.</p>	<p>SG Champions</p>
<p>4.4</p>	<p>It was noted that TL had agreed to be the champion for Noise Complaints. EAL to circulate the latest noise reports when JMcC returns from holiday.</p> <p>It was agreed to put Airport Designation on hold due to anticipated involvement with the current ACP.</p>	<p>EAL</p>
<p>4.5</p>	<p>RG to be the champion for Growth A report on the airport growth points would be useful. Christophe can forward this information. The predictions of growth are interesting and environmental concerns are affected by this. It was noted that France was considering a ban on internal flights where viable alternative transport was available. This was also being considered in Denmark.</p> <p>MA is the point of contact for EAL in relation to the ACP</p> <p>Governance Sub-Group Nothing to report</p>	<p>RG/CM</p>

5.	5. EANAB ANNUAL REPORT	
	<p>It was noted that information requested by the Chair had now been received and the Annual Report was being updated including a revised layout.</p> <p>Corrections to the report: “Address” to replace “achieve” in Table of Achievements Aims 2 & 6: Edinburgh, Lothians, Falkirk and Fife P3 Item 1: “whom” they represent P5 last paragraph “it is to be expected – we don’t have the noise monitoring results yet only on SIDs. A new spectrum of analysis is required. To70 report findings should be included in the Annual Report. It was agreed that the sub-group would work with the Chair to include these in the report. “Ongoing work on noise reduction with its full implications” to be added It was agreed to include a link in the report to the Membership section of the EANAB website rather than list all members in detail in the Annual Report.</p>	
5.1		LC/AC
5.2	<p>It was noted that since R McLeod had not attended more than 5 meetings and had not submitted any apologies, he should be removed from the Board in line with the Code of Conduct. He should also be removed from the Google Mail Group.</p>	RG/PP
6.	AOB NAP response. EAL had circulated this just before the May meeting. It was agreed to discuss this at the next meeting	
6.1	<p>EACC It was noted that the Board had previously requested that the Chair circulate any presentations he would be making at EACC meetings on behalf of the Board prior to the meeting. The Chair stated that he had only given a summary on health on behalf of SS.</p> <p>EAL agreed to check if the EACC CEO report could be made available to EANAB and/or if it was available on the EAL website.</p>	EAL
6.2	<p>It was agreed to invite Robert Carr to a meeting to forge good links between the two groups.</p> <p>Newbridge Planning Application As a Statutory Consultee, Ratho & District CC can submit a further comment on the proposed new development. It was noted that the noise assessment was based on only 30 minutes of take-offs of 7 aircraft three of which were turbo props On the basis of this noise assessment the developer is advised to put in a level of insulation.</p>	MA

6.3	The noise consultant had stated his assessment was “A worst case scenario”. It was agreed that EANAB should submit a further response. MA agreed to draft this and circulate it to the Board before submitting. It was noted that the original EANAB comment isn’t visible on the Planning Portal but is listed.	MA
7.	DATE OF NEXT MEETING: Wednesday 3rd July 2019 at 6.30pm in the Marriott Hotel	
	There being no further business LC thanked everyone for their time and closed the meeting.	